

---

---

*WORKING PAPER SERIES*

---

---

*CenPRIS WP 116/10*

**THE SUSTAINABLE PENANG INITIATIVE: PARTICIPATORY AND ACTION-ORIENTED APPROACHES IN MEASURING AND IMPROVING COMMUNITY WELL-BEING**

Professor Dato' Anwar Fazal

*JAN 2010*

[ Available online at <http://www.usm.my/cenpris/> ]

CenPRIS Working Paper No. 116/10

Jan 2010

**Note: the paper is not meant to represent the views or opinions of CenPRIS or its Members. Any errors are the responsibility of the author(s).**

## **ABSTRACT**

### **THE SUSTAINABLE PENANG INITIATIVE: PARTICIPATORY AND ACTION-ORIENTED APPROACHES IN MEASURING AND IMPROVING COMMUNITY WELL-BEING**

*Anwar Fazal shares insights from the Sustainable Penang Initiative (SPI), a two year pioneering project based in the State of Penang, Malaysia. It describes how the project systematically addressed the challenge of sustainable development at the local level through a systematic process of popular consultations, creating community indicators and developing participatory action plans. These consultations were held around a five point vision - social justice, ecological sustainability, economic productivity, cultural vibrancy and popular participation. Creative methods of brainstorming and action orientation through skilled facilitation and the active participation of stakeholders from civil society, state and business led to both concrete inputs into the State Governments Strategic Plan and several new partnerships around key issues such as water, empowering people with disabilities, and public transport. The project was supported by the Canada based Institute on Governance, and involved several United Nations agencies.*

**KEYWORDS:** sustainable development; community indicators; popular participation; community planning; penang

Professor Dato' Anwar Fazal

Director

The Right Livelihood College

Centre for Policy Research and International Studies

Universiti Sains Malaysia.

Penang

Email : [anwarfazal@usm.my](mailto:anwarfazal@usm.my)

ISSN : 2180-0146

## Introduction

The State of Penang (a name which means betel nut or “pinang” in the Malay language) is in the north west of Malaysia and remarkable for many things. Located at the northern entrance of the, probably globally busiest, Straits of Malacca, it has had a unique history as a colony, a trading outpost, a free port and is now among other things the “Fish and Chips” capital of the world! The World Fish Centre is located there and so are two of the world’s largest and leading computer chip makers Intel and AMD. Less well known is that Penang is also the headquarters of several global civil society networks including the World Alliance of Breastfeeding Action (WABA), the International Baby Food Action Network (IBFAN) and the Third World Network (TWN), the latter a global leader of civil society advocacy on a fair and just global economic system.

One of the 13 States of Malaysia, Penang is remarkable for both its globalness and its interactive diversity in ethnicity, language, culture and religion. A small country that is among the 20 top trading nations of the world, Malaysia also assumed the leadership of both the Organisation of Islamic Conference (OIC) and the Non Aligned Movement (NAM) at the same time. The state of Penang is also unique in that it was lead by a minority party within a National coalition called the “Barisan”, with a Chinese Buddhist former academic as the Chief Minister in a nation with Islam as the official Religion! Recently, an activist accountant from the opposition took over in a seismic change.

The bustling sea port and airport is located in a physical dualism comprising a turtle shaped island and a strip of land on the Malay Peninsular. It is not only an industrial base and a civil society leader but was also given world heritage status by the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) for its port city and capital George Town.

This unique interactive blend of “soil, soul and society”, and its rich diversity ecologically (it has the smallest National Park in the world) and culturally has meant that the management of tensions – economics, social, cultural, ecological and political – becomes a central necessity. A great challenge in such a dynamic and diverse community is always to create a framework that is constructive, holistic, cooperative, futuristic and yet action oriented.

This is the brief story of such a framework, the Sustainable Penang Initiative, a pioneering effort in the Asia Pacific region.

## **Background**

The origin of this initiative was serendipity, a chance meeting with Kathleen Lauder of Canada and the writer at the office of the United Nations in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. This led to a series of meetings of minds of several actors – global and local, government and civil society, academic and activists and all with the openness of creativity and adventure.

At the global level there was the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) funded programme of the Institute of Governance (IOG) - the Canada – ASEAN Governance Innovation Network (CAGIN) program, which was headed by Kathleen Lauder. Then there was the United Nations Urban Management Programme for Asia and the Pacific (UMPAP), which I was heading.

At the local level was the newly formed Penang state government initiated “think tank”, the Social-Economic and Environmental Research Institute (SERI). This institute was the first in the country to have all these three dimensions social, economic and environmental - in its name and its vision and I had been invited to lead its work.

My idea to launch this new “think tank” was to also make it a “heart tank”. A plan was developed to generate a very participative process involving people addressing problems and providing solutions in a creative, comprehensive, futuristic and action oriented way. I was inspired by the Sustainable Seattle Initiative which I had become aware of through Alan Atkisson who led it (He was later Director of the Earth Council in Costa Rica and now head of a leading programme on Sustainability). We were connected through a unique network of social transformation called The Belaton group which was facilitated by the brilliant Diana Meadows and through the People Centred Development Forum (PDF) facilitated by the visionary Dr. David Korten (whose book “The Turning Point – From Empire to Earth Community” is just the kind of holistic futurism that inspired us then).

## **Objectives**

The five specific objectives of the initiative in the original document written out by Tan Pek Leng, a former Executive Director of SERI were to:

- a) Develop a series of indicators for gauging sustainable development
- b) Develop the model for a holistic and sustainable development plan that takes into consideration social, cultural and environmental dimensions besides the conventional economics ones.
- c) Establish a mechanism for public input and consensus building based on partnership between government, the business sector and civil society.
- d) Channel the output of the consensus process to relevant authorities in order to influence development planning and policy formulation
- e) Educate the public about sustainable development and how to achieve it.

These objectives were to be realized through a series of well organized roundtables around what I called the "Panchasila" (Five Principles) of a sustainable future:

- a) Ecological Balance
- b) Social Justice
- c) Economic Productivity
- d) Cultural Vibrancy
- e) Popular Participation

## **The Process**

In the organization of those "roundtables" there were four major considerations:

- 1) Ensuring the partnership of diversity of people and opinions, and involving the three sectors – government, business and civil society.
- 2) Exposing the participants to the issues at three levels – global, national and local; there were three speakers to share the thinking from each of those perspectives in each of the roundtables.
- 3) A very participative process of small group interactive sessions lead by expert and enthusiastic facilitators (Khoo Salma Nasution of the Penang Heritage Trust, and Susan Siew of WABA were particularly outstanding). The groups carefully and caringly identified elements of a vision, "burning issues", actions needed and "champions" to lead them. All the familiar participatory techniques of mental mapping, voting through green dots, "power trees", "fish bone" diagrams, among others were used – People with hearing, visual and physical disabilities were actively involved in every roundtable, requiring translators, and great sensitivity. The idea was to create a sense of awareness, listening, generating ideas, building consensus, a "can-do" team spirit from the commitment of a common vision. A vibrant caring, joyful and "must do something" synergy was liberated from a professionally, ethnically and spiritually diverse group. Great sensitivity to gender and specially disadvantaged groups was always shown. Because of

concerns that the English language may limit the participation of vernacular groups, two special roundtables were organized in the Malay and Chinese languages showing the "soul" of this genuinely participatory exercise.

- 4) The aim of the process was very goal-oriented to lead to new practices and partnerships, concrete products and policies and generally set-in place a new "think" about holistic sustainable development on a long term basis in an action oriented way i.e. to have building blocks that will take us to the future. It was about setting destinations, building bridges and crossing them!

## **The Outcomes**

Several remarkable outputs emerged over a two year intense process. It brought together some 50 – 80 persons for each of the roundtables involving, altogether, some 500 participants. Some key features were:

- a) A roundtable report was brought out after each session. It not only provided details of the input but also action that can be taken, and all in sufficient detail for those who may wish to take up such a process.
- b) A vision statement for each of the roundtables was developed and they are attached as Appendix A. They are reproduced in full as they most of capture the key challenges and feature several what I call "universalities". Khoo Salma Nasution as the Coordinator of the Initiative played a pivotal role in the synthesis and articulation of these vision statements
- c) The culmination of the process was "The Penang Peoples Forum" where:
  - i. 5 school children voiced their visions of a sustainable Penang
  - ii. A mock "report card" on the "state of Penang" was presented to the Chief Minister of Penang.
  - iii. 40 issues and community identified indicators were presented to the Forum.
  - iv. Three new "champion" groups which were born during the process were presented - Water Watch Penang (WWP), Sustainable Independent Living Access (SILA) and Sustainable Transport Environment Penang (STEP). A note of each of these "children" of the Initiative, or "Emergent Action Groups", is attached as Appendix B and demonstrate the very action oriented nature of the venture.
    - A "Peoples Report" was launched and has been widely disseminated locally and globally. It captures the process and presents the products. A summary of the indicators used in the Peoples Report Card is attached as Appendix C and gives the range and focus of the groups.
    - A "21.21" initiative promoting a process of 21 ideas for the 21<sup>st</sup> century, was launched (see Appendix D) as a creative idea to plant the seeds of future innovation. Although the 21.21 Initiative was not followed

through it remains as an idea to motivate future action and I believe that such creative openness is like seeds that may lay dormant but spring into life when the right stimulation or "life forces" touch them! A new group at the Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM) is already considering this idea as a launching pad for a programme on "Education for Sustainable Development".

## **The Future**

The "Penang Peoples Report" was intended to be the trigger for carrying on the process. It was compiled systematically as a "Sourcebook" of ideas and contacts to ensure:

- a) Communication - creating public awareness and providing a focal point for discussions about sustainable development and rising these issues to a higher level of public debate.
- b) Education - providing an educational tool that could be used by teachers, private and public decision-makers, and community organizations.
- c) Media Interest - serving as handy reference to help journalists keep tabs on important issues.
- d) Benchmarking - monitoring issues, actions and policies that impact on sustainability and quality of life in Penang as well as providing some benchmarks as a basis for future monitoring.
- e) Holistic approaches - demonstrating links between the five areas of concern – environment, community, economy, culture and participation.
- f) Policy Advocacy - soliciting ideas, recommendations and feedback that could become an important input into the Penang Strategic Development Plan for the next decade.

In each of the six areas there were notable achievements:

- a) Popular Participation became a more frequent norm in the government working system. This was demonstrated on a follow up project called "People Friendly Government" and the setting up of a Local Government Consultative Council.
- b) The Second Penang Strategic Development Plan which is the government overarching framework took as its five thrusts the "Panchasila" of the Sustainable Penang Initiative, although some words were adapted to be palatable to governmental interests. The terms used were:
  - i. Ecological Balance
  - ii. Economic Competitiveness (instead of "Economic Productivity")
  - iii. Cultural Vibrancy
  - iv. Caring and Sharing (instead of "Social Justice")

- v. Good Governance (instead of "Popular Participation").
- c) WWP, SILA and STEP, the emergent –action groups, continue to be very active in advocacy and have seen to some tangible results in government thinking and actions

### **Conclusion**

A unique and inspiring pioneering process was set in place systematically with considerable creative fun and results and excellent documentation. The spirit of the process lives on in the "visioning" having become mainstream and the "actors" continuing to articulate what is always a continuing journey of "stops and starts", and sometimes leaps of hope and springs of action. The Sustainable Penang Initiative was one of those leaps and even if the challenge of the "stop and starts" continue, as each government and generation needs to learn and do it their way, the vision it provides, and the participation process it used, will be enduring. We have just begun "Sustainable Penang Initiative 2" to address the many new challenges of today and the looming disasters!

### **Further Readings**

- 1) Indicators of Sustainable Development Framework and Methodologies, United Nations, New York, 1996.
- 2) The Sustainable Penang Initiative: Penang People's Report "Social-Economic and Environmental Research Institute (SERI), 1999.
- 3) The Sustainable Penang Initiative: Involving Citizens in the Development Planning: Chapter 7, "Opting for Partnership: Good Governance Innovation in South East Asia." Joaquin L . Gonzalez III, Kathleen Lauder, Brenda Melles, Institute of Governance, 2000.
- 4) The Sustainable Penang Initiative: Creating State-Society Partnerships for Sustainable Development – Salma Khoo Nasution, International Institute for Environmental Development (IIED) Urban Environmental Action Plans and Local Agenda 21 Series, Working Paper 7, 2004.
- 5) The Penang Malaysia Experiment in People, Private and Public Partnerships: Process, Progress and Procedures. Tan Peck Leng. Asia Pacific Perspectives, Vol. V, Number 2, August , 2005, University of San Francisco Center for Pacific Rim.

## Appendix A

### ROUNDTABLE VISION STATEMENT

#### (1) Vision for Penang's Ecological Sustainability

Recognizing that the state of Penang has wonderfully diverse ecosystems consisting of rivers, coastlines, mangroves, coastal and hill forests within a small area of 1,031 square kilometers.

that these ecosystems represent the richness of biological diversity, as well as serving as our ecological life-support systems by providing clean air and water and the maintenance of ecological balance,

that these fragile ecosystems have to accommodate Penang's growing population (presently 1.28 million people) and sustain the increasingly greater demands of population, urbanisation and industrialisation.

realising that as a highly urbanised state heavily reliant on imports and inputs of natural resources and goods. Penang's ecological sustainability cannot be considered in isolation, but has to be seen in the context of national and global sustainability:

that the sustainable development of Penang must also mean sustainable consumption and sustainable production in terms of global sharing and intergenerational equity.

and that we need to examine the implications of these principles in terms of our policies towards population growth, urban migration, lifestyle, transport and land use:

We who have gathered in Penang at the Roundtable on Ecological Sustainability on 8-9 November 1997 urge that the people and government of Penang be committed to a path of sustainable development and a vision of an ecologically sustainable Penang:

1. A state in which our remaining natural ecosystems are protected through appropriate legislation, development policies and integrated coastal management - in particular, protecting our hill forests and water catchment areas from forest clearing, hill cutting, urban encroachment and agricultural pesticides; and protecting our coastal zones, encompassing riversheds, rivers, mangroves, coastlines and seas, from unnecessary reclamation, environmental degradation and pollution
2. A geographical area in which our biological diversity and geodiversity are maintained. And this includes conserving and rehabilitating the habitats of vulnerable species, and the maintenance of the genetic diversity of our fruit trees and agricultural crops
3. A sustainable society which, though highly urban, attempts to be more self-sufficient and strives for a balanced development and a less exploitative relationship with the rural and natural areas in its immediate hinterland and also in other parts of the world; through practices such as reduced consumption of fossil fuels, water and natural resources, sustainable agriculture, waste recycling, reducing emission of greenhouse gasses and eradication of ozone-depleting substances

4. A responsive and accountable government which is committed to preventing all those environmental problems and disruptions which can be avoided with better development planning and environmental controls - such as lead pollution, acid rain, river and marine pollution, coastal erosion and soil erosion due to hill cutting, haphazard development, flash floods, dengue and cholera outbreak, traffic jams etc.
5. An intelligent and forward-thinking community which fosters partnerships for sustainable development among government, business and industry, academia, non-government and community based organisations and committed individuals: establishing relevant and reliable indicators to monitor the state of Penang's environment, and using these indicators to correct its actions and guide itself on a path of sustainable development
6. A progressive business community which pursues economic growth through investment in green technologies and improving environmental quality while promoting environmental best practices and occupational health and safety in the manufacturing, construction, agricultural and service industries
7. A civic-minded place where Penang people of all ages care about the environment and keep it clean, green and peaceful, by taking initiatives such as planting our quota of Malaysia's 1 million trees according to schedule (without cutting down any more), policing ourselves on littering, disciplining ourselves to sort and recycle our waste, and constantly educating ourselves and others about environment and ecological sustainability
8. A highly livable place which provides quality of life through quality of urban and rural environment, with blue skies, fishable rivers and swimmable seas, a wealth of green open spaces, parks and natural recreational areas, urban heritage trees, good civic amenities, walkable and cyclable pathways and integrated public transport for people of all ages and backgrounds
9. A people-centred state which promotes holistic human and social ecology through good, climatically appropriate housing, organic farming and healthy, sustainable lifestyles, especially those which are resonant with Penang's cultural traditions, for example by promoting wholesome eating habits and traditional biodegradable packaging, reinstating pedestrian-friendly urban patterns and developing an eco-heritage city flagship project
10. A centre of excellence in research, monitoring, planning, advocacy and best practice which works to ensure that Penang's development is sustainable: ideally focusing these efforts by establishing a national and international Centre for Sustainable Development on Penang Hill

## **(2) Vision for Penang's Social Justice**

Recognizing that Penang is a pluralistic society with a special legacy of tolerance, mutual respect and cooperation, and that all the people of Penang, including people with special needs. and in particular children and the younger generation, have a long-term stake in the future of their state,

Considering that with its relative economic well-being and its long tradition of social institutions, civil society and voluntarism. Penang is well-positioned to foster an equitable. fully-participatory, caring society.

We who have gathered in Penang at the Roundtable on Social Justice Sustainability on 14 February 1998 urge that the people and government of Penang be committed to a path of sustainable development and a vision of a socially just Penang:

1. A state-society partnership which will establish socially just. transparent and accountable governance, promote access to information and spearhead the re-establishment of local government elections
2. A government which shares power and serves the needs of all sections of the community. especially the weak and poor, and not only investors and developers: and an empowered community that is prepared to organise itself for social improvement and sustainable development
3. A humane society where everyone has a place. where people and human dignity matter, where family and community are valued and affirmed. where the young, the sick and the old are looked after, and where people with special needs do not find their needs ignored.
4. An equitable society in which men and women. rich and poor, the socially challenged and people from diverse ethnic backgrounds are given equal opportunity to jobs and are represented in all levels of the power structure
5. A sustainable society where economic development narrows the gap between the haves and have-nots, rewards workers fairly and does not destroy the environment, displace people or disenfranchise communities.
6. A liveable society which is child-friendly, parent-friendly, senior citizen-friendly, disabled friendly, hearing-impaired-friendly, vision-impaired friendly and pedestrian-friendly. which provides adequate childcare, recreational, social facilities and public amenities and does not marginalise those who do not have access to cars, condominiums, clubs and credit cards.
7. A safe society where people are not driven to crime out of desperation, where women, children and the weak can go about without fear, where people do not need to turn their homes into prisons where safety is everywhere assured as much by healthy neighbourhoods and strong community feeling as it is by law and order.
8. A caring society where the young and able volunteer, and the elderly and socially challenged participate fully, where the civil society is strongly rooted in the community. and a caring government provides a safety net of social services for victims of abuse, the mentally ill, the poor and other marginalised groups.
9. A progressive state, business and industrial community which safeguards the rights of workers, including migrant workers, promotes a high level of occupational safety and health. contributes to training, education and human development and looks after the long-term interests of its workers and their

families.

10. A wholesome education system which provides affordable quality education which caters to the needs and aspirations of all groups. especially the socially challenged. and seeks to promote genuine social and human development, and to make schools child-friendly and free of pedagogical violence
11. A holistic public healthcare system which provides all-round physical, social and mental health which is equitable, affordable, accessible and sustainable, and a private healthcare system which does not exploit the sick, desperate and dying.
12. A state which promotes housing security and decent housing with adequate community facilities, open green space and quality environment for all its citizens, which does not encourage a speculative property market fuelled by the selling of property to investors and foreigners at the cost of raising the prices of homes beyond the reach of the average Penangite and which does not solve its housing problem by pushing its poor "out of sight out of mind" and relocating them into segregated low-cost substandard housing areas.
13. A state and civil society that promotes inclusive dialogue and debate, community consultation and public participation processes, such as the Sustainable Penang Initiative's civic roundtables and a Penang Popular Assembly.
14. A committed state-society partnership which is willing to take on a social plan to proactively and affirmatively work towards goals of social justice and sustainable community wellbeing.

### **(3) Vision for Penang's Economic Productivity**

Recognizing that the objective of a productive economy is to provide goods, services and a means of livelihood to its people. and that people are the most important agents of a productive economy, recognizing that Penang's greatest economic resource is its enterprising and educated people, supported by a reasonably good infrastructure, access, communications and environment.

that Penang's main economic strengths have shifted from the traditional sectors of trading, agriculture and fishing to the modern sectors of industry, tourism and services, all the while complemented by a dynamic informal sector, and that its people and leadership have demonstrated their ability to take advantage of changing economic conditions and to lead in new fields.

that Penang's sub-economy is heavily linked to national and international trade and investment, and at the same time heavily dependent upon imports of essential goods and resources such as water, food and raw materials, and that during this time of economic slowdown, it would be appropriate for us to take stock of our economic strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats, and rethink our strategies for the future:

We who have gathered in Penang at the Roundtable on Economic Productivity on 11 April 1998 urge that the people and government of Penang be committed to a path of sustainable development and a vision of an economically productive Penang:

1. A balanced society which pursues social development, improved environment and quality of life in tandem with economic development.
2. A balanced economy which means balancing growth and sustainability, balancing different sectors of the economy (e.g. agriculture, manufacturing etc.), balancing local, national & international exchanges. and balancing social, humanistic and economic factors of productivity.
3. A competitive economy which optimizes the use of resources and minimizes waste, and grows intelligently by broadening and deepening value added linkages.
4. A people-centred society which provides the infrastructure and maintenance culture for a well planned living and working environment, and ensures the availability of basic services such as housing. infrastructure. public transport, health and education.
5. A progressive society which strives to generate economic and educational opportunities for all communities and sectors of society. and devotes particular effort to equalizing opportunities for women, for example by providing childcare amenities, as well as equalizing opportunities for the disadvantaged and marginalised groups, for example by creating barrier-free environments.
6. A worker-centred economy that emphasises occupational health and safety, good working conditions, a motivating reward structure and skills development in order to enhance livelihood and productivity.
7. A people-centred economy that recognizes that small is not only beautiful but also promotes self-help and resilience, encourages small-medium entrepreneurs and family businesses, provides support to businesses which service-the neighbourhood and local community, and gently guides Without over-regulating - the informal sector such as food hawkers and cottage industries.
8. A sustainable business environment which is anti-speculative, checking the speculation of currency, stocks, credit and property, and anti-inflationary, striving to enhance the purchasing power of each and every consumer.
9. A strong and effective local authority which strengthens planning, environmental standards and enforcement and does not allow haphazard development which tend to create infrastructure bottle-necks, pollute or degrade the environment.
10. An enlightened state government that believes in having informed public policies, and which practices rational economic planning based on the systematic collection of information, research and analysis, taking into account the environmental and social impacts of its economic strategies.
11. A far-sighted state government that properly manages its assets and natural resources such as water, land and forest: in particular, realising that we are already facing a permanent water crisis and that water is our most important limitation to economic development, it is important to ensure water security by conserving the use of water in domestic, commercial, agricultural and industrial sectors, rethinking economic strategies in terms of water use, working to protect watersheds and attempting to make Penang more self-sufficient in water.
12. A corruption-free business environment fostered by clean, transparent and accountable governance and strong business ethics, and a socially responsible

business leadership which is part of a mature and progressive civil society.

13. A centre of excellence in education, innovation, green technologies, research and development, information technology and alternative learning towards sustainable development.
14. A state-society partnership that invests in human resource development, by making higher education more accessible, providing continuing education and promoting transfer of technology.

#### **(4) Vision for Penang's Cultural Vibrancy**

Recognizing that Penang is a multicultural society with a rich history and a wealth of spiritual and artistic traditions, historic communities, heritage buildings and ecologically diverse landscapes, and that these cultural endowments are the rightful inheritance of our children and youth.

considering that Penang's cultural vibrancy and diversity is essential to its quality of life, long-term social and economic sustainability.

recognizing that some of our best-loved places exemplify best practices of sustainable society such as the 'Street of Harmony and Peace' along Jalan Masjid Kapitan Kling, which teaches us about a culture of peaceful co-existence, the shophouse city which teaches us about sustainable urban patterns, or the Balik Pulau community and habitat which teaches us a culture of living in harmony with the environment.

recognizing that Penang has a great tradition of street culture, street food, street traders, street celebrations and street theatre, that is lively, friendly, popular, culturally vibrant, economically resilient and socially equitable.

considering that Penang's myriad customs, costumes, trades, languages, lifestyles, literature and the arts are the special strengths of Penang, and that these represent an accumulation of knowledge and cultural resources which will help develop the peoples' human and economic potential.

considering that Penang's tradition of excellence in education, one which includes the oldest library and oldest schools in the country, has consistently produced many great achievers who contribute to Penang's economic productivity.

considering that Penang's traditional and local culture is neither fixed nor unchanging but is constantly evolving and being constructed anew as it interacts with technology, modernity and transnational global culture.

We who have gathered in Penang at the Roundtable on Cultural Vibrancy on 27-28 June 1998 urge that the people and government of Penang be committed to a path of sustainable development and a vision of a culturally vibrant Penang:

1. A heritage-conscious society that takes up custodianship of its artistic and cultural traditions, built heritage and cultural landscapes so that future generations are not deprived of their cultural inheritance, and a government which conserves and promotes heritage not only for tourists, but mainly for the cultural education and inspiration of Penangites and Malaysians.
2. A culturally confident society where young and old do not suffer from cultural cringe ("fear of no culture" and therefore feeling that other cultures are superior to their own) but know, take pride and rejoice in their own culture and ethos, and where the older generation is actively transmitting cultural knowledge and sense of identity to the younger generation.

3. A people-centred society in which 'ordinarily sacred places' and ordinary traditions are treasured, because ordinary people matter, and which develops knowledge and stewardship for these places and traditions, for example through a process of cultural mapping and community visioning.
4. An enlightened society which recognizes the importance of local history, social history, cultural history and a people-centred history, which recovers the history of local places, ordinary people, historic minorities, and marginalised peoples.
5. A state and society which promotes multiculturalism and cultural diversity, for example by protecting the habitat and economic basis of historic communities, allowing cultural minorities to reaffirm their cultural identities, and encouraging the transmission of diverse languages and dialects.
6. A culturally mature society which promotes the expansion of shared spaces, shared values, common languages and the common heritage of the various ethnic and religious communities.
7. A people-centred city which encourages the flourishing of street culture by creating more and more pedestrian-friendly streets for people.
8. A state and society partnership that pursues a development strategy that values diversity of habitat, promotes urban quality, conserves traditional greenery and open spaces, endorses and promotes climatically appropriate and culturally appropriate housing, building and planning, and protects us all from modern 'uglytechure'.
9. A culturally vigorous society that is able to meet modern cultural challenges, for example by positively engaging technology, modernity and transnational influences to strengthen and diversify its own culture, rather than allowing the local culture to be colonized, weakened or eroded by globalization.
10. A culturally developed society where the creative potential of our local talent - performers, artisans and artists - can be realized through the support of government, media and public, adequate cultural infrastructure and infostructure.
11. A culturally discerning society that values authenticity over pastiche, which chooses substance over spectacle, endorses the creative rather than commercial and nurtures local creative responses to modernity and globalization.
12. A healthy youth culture that is nourished by ample spaces, places and opportunities for creativity, recreation and friendship.
13. A school system that encourages critical thinking, creativity and innovation, for example by strengthening art education and promoting extra-curricular activities which build character and encourage students to learn about their environment.
14. An esteemed centre of higher learning which provides increasing educational opportunities, continuous learning and increasing educational choice for a wider range of people.
15. A reading culture and information culture supported by libraries, publishing and literary activities, through initiatives such as a state-of the-art fully accessible library in the middle of the city, a good Penang Collection, a centre for second-hand book retailers, and a Friends of the Library movement.
16. A resourceful society which endeavours to develop its indigenous knowledge,

traditional skills and cultural resources in all areas of life, for example by creating centres for researching, developing and transmitting traditional healthcare, craftsmanship and arts.

17. A culturally-conscious civil society which develops linkages between cultural vibrancy and ecological, social and economic sustainability, for example by showcasing culturally appropriate best practices.
18. A pro-women culture which engenders the workplace and the public sphere to suit women's needs, for example by mainstreaming the breastfeeding culture.
19. A historically dynamic society with a conscious strategy of reinvesting in social and cultural capital, for example by mobilising Penang's historic guilds and associations in responding to cultural, social and economic challenges of the future.
20. A state and society partnership which strives for cultural excellence and sustainable development in human settlements, for example, by putting the "Historic Enclave of George Town & Fort Cornwallis" - a living heritage city - on the World Heritage Map.
21. A place which is so culturally, socially and economically attractive that it can attract the best minds and talents from all over the country to live and work in Penang, and contribute to Penang's cultural vibrancy and economic productivity.

### **(5) Vision for Penang's Popular Participation**

Recognizing that Penang is a pluralistic society with a strong tradition in decentralized community self governance, and that in modern times Penang has been a pioneer in establishing modern Local Government and a relatively progressive state Government.

Recognizing that the people of Penang have created and sustained a strong culture of participatory, caring, civil society, starting from the traditional civil society made up of clan, district, ethnic and religious associations and trusts, to the modern movement in non-governmental organisations, community-based organisations and volunteer groups, some of which have emerged as regional leaders in their fields.

Considering that all the people of Penang, including people with special needs, and in particular children and the younger generation, should have a say in the governance of their city and state. .

We who have gathered in Penang at the Roundtable on Popular Participation on 19-20 September 1998 urge that the people and government of Penang be committed to a path of sustainable development and a vision of a fully-participatory governance of Penang:

1. A governance culture of integrity and transparency, fostered by incorruptible leaders who lead by example, as well as clean, efficient and trustworthy public servants who truly serve the public.
2. A transparent government that will review and abolish all obsolete, repressive and easily abused laws such as the Internal Security Act and the Official Secrets Act: guarantee our rights and civil liberties through Freedom of Information and Freedom of Assembly Acts, and promote easier access to information and freedom of the press.
3. A government and people that believe that democracy is not just about voting once every five years, but about fostering equitable representation and continuous popular participation in all areas of governance.

4. A planning authority that upholds the public interest and recognizes the community as stakeholders. believes in planning from below and values popular participation in social. economic and physical development from initial planning to planning approval stage to implementation and even including obtaining feedback after implementation.
5. A pro-people government that grants all the people of Penang a say in the future of Penang. by giving them many opportunities to speak up and to be heard, if necessary by going down to the ground and organising participatory consultations with the people. by listening carefully to the ordinary people and the marginalised people. so that the voice of the silent majority will not be drowned by the shouts of a few rich, powerful, very important persons.
6. A gender-balanced society where women are equally and equitably represented at all levels of governance.
7. A state that will revive the local elections to ensure a progressive, transparent. responsive and accountable Local Government, and which in the mean time would appoint local councillors who are geographically accountable, sector accountable and capable of representing the interests of their communities, including representatives from NGOs. disabled groups, environmental groups and hawkers.
- 8 A government that has the political will to protect the public interest in our environment and cultural heritage. strictly enforce environmental and cultural protection laws. and lead us out of this ecological and environmental crisis by forging the path of sustainable urban development.
9. A government that recognizes the contributions of its people - whether they participate as concerned individuals, volunteers. NGOs or community organisations - and that provides incentives and supports local initiatives for social equity, environment and cultural heritage.
10. A people who does not tolerate paternalistic decision-making, or tidakapathy, who know their rights and responsibilities, and ensure they are consulted in every matter that affects their lives.
11. Law-abiding. fair-minded. responsible and accountable people both in and out of government who do not exploit political connections for self interest, do not take or give bribes, practice cronyism or indulge in double standards.
12. Nature-loving, water-conserving, environment conscious, civic conscious, and public-spirited citizens that takes responsibility for their habitat and environment, do not leave everything to the government or expect the government to do everything for them, but are willing to organise themselves for social and environmental improvement through gotong-royong. Citizen's Watch and other local initiatives.

## **(6) Vision for Penang's Malay and Muslim Communities**

Considering that Penang's Malay and Muslim communities, such as in Balik Pulau and Seberang Perai, have strong historical ties to land, water and natural resources, having lived in a sustainable relationship with their environment for many generations,

that as communities at the urban frontier, they may have a different experience of the process of development, from that of core urban populations.

Recognizing that "balanced development" is development that does not threaten environmental balance, traditional habitats and the well-being of communities:

We who have participated in the Malay language Roundtable on Balanced Development for the State of Penang on 3 October 1998 recommend that Penang's government and communities:

1. Recognize cultural identity and cultural diversity, which reflects the richness of God's creation, instead of merely Malay, Chinese and Indian racial stereotypes.
2. Defend the traditional kampung habitat, whether rural, urban or peri-urban, and improve the living environment by upgrading infrastructure and amenities, and not through whole-scale redevelopment which dislocates communities.
3. Defend Muslim urban heritage and historical communities in the city against the threat of inappropriate development and the effects of the rent control repeal, through heritage protection and conservation.
4. Strengthen family ties, social cohesion and transmission of cultural, social and spiritual values in particular to counter the negative effects of urbanization.
5. Make education more relevant through local examples, case studies and field trips, especially in history, geography and environmental education.
6. Draw upon traditional wisdom, idioms and folklore as the basis of social conduct and values, and as the inspiration for language and literary development.
7. Enhance the role of traditional religious leadership by ensuring that mosque officials are popularly elected and well respected, and that Friday sermons have local relevance.
8. Use energy more efficiently, check consumerism and wastefulness, and take up stewardship of creation and the living environment.
9. Give due importance to the environment through sensitive urban and rural planning, and through rehabilitation of forest, hill slopes, mangrove and natural environments.
10. Enhance the role of mosques as community centres by first of all appropriately siting the mosques in established communities (rather than having drive-in mosques), by making the mosque an educational and community resource centre, and not allowing the mosque to be used for politicking.
11. Gazette agricultural land and mangrove areas and check conversion of such land to other uses to ensure greater ecological sustainability and security for traditional farming and fishing communities.
12. Stop all wasteful, prestige and mega projects which do not benefit the people and which bring about environmental, social and economic imbalance.
13. Emphasize spiritual, mental, emotional, human and cultural development and promote people-centred development which encourages social transactions

- and community interaction. instead of physical or concrete development.
- 14 Establish nature parks that promote the appreciation of natural heritage among children and youth, instead of Western-style theme parks.
  15. Green the city in order to reduce air pollution, and provide more green lungs and nature reserves.
  16. Provide quality housing and living environments, with social and physical access. recreational parks. open spaces, childcare and community facilities especially for children, the elderly, women and people with disabilities.
  17. Save the family from economic tyranny which inflicts stress on parents, in particular women, who take on the "double burden" of work and housework, and results in family tensions and neglected children.
  18. Question interest-independent economics which leads us deeper into debt and credit dependent growth, which means borrowing from the future.
  19. Curb currency, share, commodities and property speculation and check widespread corporatization and privatization that enriches the privileged few.
  20. Revive barter trading and introduce alternative trading systems and the use of bi-metallic currencies in particular, the traditional dinar and dirham, initially for zakat and dowries eventually as legal tender.
  21. Revive co-operatives as an alternative to corporatization, revitalize the institution of trust lands (waqf) and re-instate collective ownership of the commons.
  22. Ensure that waqf land and property is managed with transparency, integrity and accountability, recognizing that in waqf development, the descendants of the benefactor and the community have the right to be consulted, and that long leases and interest-based loans should be avoided.
  23. Foster balanced development, by recognizing the intrinsic value of sustainable communities, agriculturally productive land and natural resources, and the inviability of credit-based. speculative. destructive construction and worthless over-development which threatens to destroy the things of real value.
  24. Extend the discussions on balanced development to more groups of people from different social backgrounds by organising further roundtables of a similar nature to gather feedback about the real effects of development and to formulate holistic and balanced development policies for the future.

## **(7) Vision for Penang's Chinese Communities**

Considering that the state of Penang has one of the largest concentrations of Chinese communities in Malaysia, consisting of diverse dialect groups and occupational traditions, which have consistently placed a high value on education, traditional culture and economic development.

Recognizing that sustainable development is development that is in harmony with cultural values, socially and environmentally responsible. and economically sustainable.

We who have participated in the Chinese language Roundtable on Balanced, Sustainable Development for the State of Penang on 16 January 1999 recommend that:

1. The government, authorities institutions and the press should disseminate and provide access to relevant, accurate and timely information: the press should be given more freedom to carry out their task of keeping the public informed: and the public should take part in ensuring a flow of information. for example by setting up a People's Participation Bureau.
2. The government should be more accountable in implementing policies and projects. inviting the people to take part in decision-making, and the people should become more aware and more interested in political and social issues.
3. The government and society should support more religious activities. increase diversity of religious activities and organise religious roundtables, as well as encourage the setting up of religious associations in schools and incorporate the instruction of religious values in the subject of civic education.
4. The government and society should inculcate an awareness of one's origins and heritage, and promote the conservation of buildings of religious and cultural significance.
5. The government and relevant institutions should provide information about the role of various associations. and government should ensure that the committees of each organisation adhere to their objectives and functions, and not misuse the organisation for other purposes.
6. The government, private sector and cultural associations should give concrete support to cultural development, providing more venues for cultural performances, respecting the authenticity of culture and giving the responsibility of cultural development to experts and practitioners. not to bureaucrats and businessmen who may commercialise cultural activities for tourism or profit.
7. The government and private sector should monitor the numbers of disabled people who are in need of housing, and provide adequate and affordable housing which is suitably located. suitably designed and accessible for disabled people.
8. The government and private sector should address problems related to urban development, such as unfair housing contracts, inequitable distribution of low-cost housing, heritage conservation and environmental problems, e.g. water pollution, transport problems and traffic congestion. and displacement of agricultural activities.
9. The government and private sector should ensure safety of housing development and construction, especially on hill slopes such as Paya Terubong, by notifying the public (about the developer, approving officer reasons for approval etc). guaranteeing that the development conforms to relevant Acts and guidelines. establishing a professional review committee and so forth.

10. The government and private sector should safeguard the interests of existing residents and the safety of people living next to construction sites, such as Prangin Mall. and set up task forces to address the problems of victims of environmental and urban development disasters.
11. The government and private sector should not only promote the manufacturing sector, but should give more emphasis to the tourism and agriculture sectors. to diversify sources of income to improve the state's image, to decrease dependency on food imports, to improve basic facilities and to upgrade disabled access to physical environment.
12. The government should take measures to address economic decline, checking commercial crimes. reducing sales tax on local products. discouraging consumer borrowing culture. monitoring business failures and bankruptcies. monitoring loan accountability and increasing investor confidence.
13. The business community should promote business ethics, take up social and environmental responsibility in all aspects of doing business. and rethink the "Chinaman attitude" that only cares for profit and disregards the negative impacts of development, sometimes giving out charity to cover up for corrupt and irresponsible practices.

**Appendix B****EMERGENT ACTION GROUPS****(1) Water Watch Penang (WWP)**

Water Watch Penang (WWP) is a voluntary, citizens' organization set up to promote the awareness and practice of water monitoring, conservation and protection of water resources, towards the ultimate goal of a water-saving society.

The society's application for registration has been recently approved and it will be launching a program of activities to include:

- publishing and distributing articles, pamphlets, journals, periodicals and books
- promote public awareness by organising field trips, educational camps, seminars, forums, conferences, lectures and talks
- provide a link between government, water companies, NGOs and the public
- conduct research
- liaise with other societies dedicated to similar aims and objectives

Indeed the society, even while awaiting formal registration had issued a number of press releases on Penang's critical water situation and had launched a new book on community water monitoring. Grant applications to support the program of activities are being prepared for submission to the Penang Water Authority, and to the Danish Environmental Protection Agency.

More recently, it has organised a "River Walk" on 13th March 1999 as part of an educational programme to instil awareness and highlight the importance of water conservation. The event attracted about 20 participants ranging from ages 3 to 60, who were taught and performed basic water monitoring exercise to the Waterfall River (Sg Air Terjun). Due to the success of this event, another similar one will be held on 15th May with the aim of getting schools to adopt certain sections of the river where they can monitor the quality of the river. WWP has also presented several papers concerning water issues at several forums. It has also formed network with several like-minded international NGOs.

**(2) Sustainable Independent Living & Access (SILA)**

The disabled persons community in Penang, including the wheelchair-mobile, eyesight, hearing, and speech-impaired, were well-represented at most of the roundtables. They were among the first cluster to emerge, specifically to campaign for Disabled Access to Public Facilities. This coalition of pre-existing groups and disabled individuals adopted the acronym SILA (Sustainability, Independence, Living & Access) and took on as their first task the improvement of disabled access to the Penang Botanic Gardens, KOMTAR, and the vicinity of the St Nicholas Home for the Blind. Among their early successes were the decision to retrofit the draincovers at the Botanical Gardens to facilitate wheelchair access within the grounds, and a commitment from the President of the Penang Municipal Council for improved disabled access to priority public areas within the city.

More recently, SILA and SERI were selected by UNESCAP to conduct a Training Workshop to Promote Non Handicapping Environments in Malaysia (November 8-15, 1998). Activities in the eight-day program were designed to encourage teamwork and co-ordinated efforts across disability groups. Special attention was given to legislated requirements for non-handicapping design and construction of facilities and its architectural aspects, governmental and administrative process, negotiation skills, fundraising, and effective management and use of information

in campaigning. A follow-up workshop was held from April 7-11 1999 to train an additional 20 disabled people, this time to include instruction on the production and use of video tapes to document the practical situations encountered by disabled people in their daily living circumstances.

On December 2, 1998. SILA also organised the International Day of Disabled People Walk from the St. Nicholas Home for the Blind to the One-Stop Centre shopping mall. This provided an occasion for SILA to publicly acknowledge the efforts of the Penang Municipal Council in improving handicapped access, highlight the continuing poor access in the KOMTAR vicinity and the need for low-cost housing for the disabled in the River Road area. Over the next few months, additional workshops will be conducted on environmental measuring and assessment for barrier-free access (with the assistance of Singaporean advisers), disabled-friendly SIRIM standards, and sexuality and the disabled.

SILA is a network of people with disabilities committed to promoting non-handicapping environments in Penang. The group was formed in February 1998 as a result of the Sustainable Penang Initiative roundtable on Social justice organised by the Socio-Economic & Environmental Research Institute (SERI). SILA is significantly multi-ethnic, multi-lingual and multi-religious, representing the main cultural groups in Malaysia. With the movement growing by the week, SILA is likely to become a permanent network for empowering the various organisations in Penang. In the Malay language, "sila" means "please" and denotes access, as in "please come in". With ACCESS, people with disabilities can have better prospects of LIVING and INDEPENDENCE, and so be able to sustain themselves physically, mentally and spiritually, thus contributing towards social Sustainability.

The groups that are actively involved with SILA include- • Society of Disabled Persons, Penang • Eden Handicap Centre • Old Nicolites Association and St Nicholas Association for the Blind • Society of the Blind, Malaysia (SBM) • BAM Braille Library

• Penang Deaf Association • YMCA Deaf Club and Self-Reliance Centre for the Deaf • Spastic Childrens' Centre (SPC). Among the smart partnerships achieved by this group is bringing together: • People with physical disabilities and who are visually impaired (those with problems of access to physical environment) together with people who are hearing-impaired (those with problems of access to information and communication) • People with disabilities and architects, signage experts, lawyers and advocates for sustainable transport and equitable access.

### **(3) Sustainable Transport Environment Penang (STEP)**

STEP, which was formed in response to the worsening traffic and transport situation in Penang, held its inaugural public meeting on August 23, 1998, on the theme Sustainable Transport Options for Penang. Among the 80 people who attended the event was Dr Hilmi Yahya, state cabinet member responsible for transportation. Dr Hilmi was present only for the opening ceremony but senior municipal councillors remained through the day, for the presentations and discussion.

Ganesh Rasagam, a SERI associate and transportation engineer who is one of the core initiators of STEP, was interviewed for the following progress report on recent Activities of STEP:

Ideal Bus-Stop Project: conceptual design for an ideal bus stop for Penang: a group of student volunteers from Australia have worked on this together with the Penang Heritage Trust and STEP (status: completed)

Press Statements: on the role of the Commercial Vehicles Licensing Board, public transport issues, etc.

Cycling Action Plan for Georgetown and Bayan Baru: proposal has been submitted to the Majlis Perbandaran Pulau Pinang (Penang Municipal Council) for their consideration: if approved. the study would begin in April 1999 as a joint project of SERI/STEP/Interface for Cycling Expertise (I-Ce). Netherlands: project will be partially funded by the Royal Dutch Embassy in Kuala Lumpur

A Cycling Day to be organised in the Pulau Tikus neighbourhood in association with schools, shopping complexes and residents associations

Photo Survey of KOMTAR Bus Station to be exhibited at the Penang People's Forum and SPI day. This survey would also be the basis for a memorandum to the Penang state government (status: survey has been completed)

STEP promotes environment-friendly, socially equitable, affordable access for all. STEP is a study group of the Sustainable Penang Initiative. A project conducted by the Socio-Economic & Environmental Research Institute (SERI). STEP is also a focal point of the Sustainable Transport Action Network for Asia and the Pacific (SUSTRAN).

The healthiest and most sustainable modes of transport are walking and cycling. The expansion of pedestrian and cyclefriendly environments greatly improves the quality of urban life and social access for all. Economic growth and increased mobility does not have to mean congestion and pollution. Investments in public transport should take precedence over investments in widening or building more roads for private motor vehicles. Efficient, affordable and clean public transport is the mark of all world-class cities.

## Appendix C

## People's Report Card

GROUP	TOPIC	INDICATOR
1 Environment	Urban Trees	No. of trees planted under the National Tree Planting Campaign
2 Community	Breastfeeding	% of babies born in baby-friendly hospitals
3 Community	Occupational Safety & Health	No. of industrial accidents
4 Economy	Corporate Environmentalism	No. of companies certified MS ISO 14001
5 Economy	Staple Food Security	"Paddy production, average rice yield"
<b>Mixed News +/-</b>		
1 Environment	Water Consumption & Supply	Water consumed per day
2 Environment	Environmental Violations	No. of cases prosecuted by DOE
3 Community	Childcare Facilities	No. of kindergartens
4 Community	Disable Access to public facilities	"No. of building complying with MS 1184. 1183
5 Community	Healthcare Expenditure	% of state health care expenditure to GDP
6 Economy	Economic Diversity	Employment concentration
7 Economy	Tourism Industry	Average hotel occupancy rate
8 Economy	Fisheries Yield	Total landing of marine fish
9 Culture	Heritages Conservation	No of inventoried heritage buildings demolished
10 Culture	Public Library Usage	Rate of public library usage
11 Participation	Employment of Women	Ratio of women employed at various job level in the manufacturing sector
12 Participation	Environmental Awareness	No of environmental complaints to DOE
<b>Challenges</b>		
1 Environment	Coastal Mangroves	Area of coverage
2 Environment	River Water Quality	Water Quality Index
3 Environment	Coastal Water Quality	% of monitored coastal waters classified unsuitable for recreation of aquaculture
4 Environment	Unmanaged Waste	No. of crows
5 Environment	Air Quality	Air Pollution Index
6 Environment	Acid Rain	pH Value of rainfall
7 Environment	Environmental Noise	Equivalent-A-weighted sound level
8 Environment	Traffic Congestion	Average traffic volume passing-2-way over 16 hours period
9 Environment	Private Vehicle Ownership	"Persons per car. Persons per motorcycle"
10 Environment	Cycling as Sustainable Transport	No. of cyclists crossing by ferry
11 Environment	Park & Open Spaces	Ratio of open space per population
12 Community	Traffic Safety	No. of casualties and fatalities from road accidents
13 Community	Children at Risk	No. of reported child abuse cases
14 Community	Social Ills Among Youth	Incidents of reported juvenile crimes
15 Community	Domestic Violence	No. of domestic violence reported
16 Community	Unplanned Pregnancies	No. of single unwed mothers in homes
17 Community	Persons with HIV & AIDS	No. of new AIDS cases and HIV carries detected
18 Culture	Culture Infrastructure	No. of built venues for arts events
19 Culture	Signage Culture	% of street signs provided
<b>Question Mark ?</b>		
1 Community	Housing Affordability	No. of new AIDS cases and HIV carries detected
2 Economy	Informal Sector	No. of licensed itinerant hawkers issued and renewed by MPPP
3 Participation	Public Participation in Town planning	% of population taking part in MPPP report of Survey
4 Participation	Voter Participation	No. of registered voters

TOPIC	INDICATOR	STATUS
<b>INDICATORS ON ENVIRONMENT ( Ecological Sustainability Roundtable )</b>		
Urban Trees	No. of trees planted under the National Tree Planting Campaign	⊖
Water Consumption & Supply	Water consumed per day	+/-
Environmental Violations	No. of cases prosecuted by DOE	+/-
Coastal Mangroves	Area of coverage	⊖
River Water Quality	Water Quality Index	⊖
Coastal Water Quality	% of monitored coastal waters classified unsuitable for recreation of aquaculture	⊖
Unmanaged Waste	No. of crows	⊖
Air Quality	Air Pollution Index	⊖
Acid Rain	pH Value of rainfall	⊖
Environmental Noise	Equivalent-A-weighted sound level	⊖
Traffic Congestion	Average traffic volume passing-2-way over 16 hours period	⊖
Private Vehicle Ownership	"Persons per car. Persons per motorcycle"	⊖
Cycling as Sustainable	No. of cyclists crossing by ferry	⊖
Park & Open Spaces	Ratio of open space per population	⊖
<b>INDICATORS ON COMMUNITY ( Social Justice Roundtable )</b>		
Breastfeeding	% of babies born in baby-friendly hospitals	⊖
Occupational Safety & Health	No. of industrial accidents	⊖
Childcare Facilities	No. of kindergartens	+/-
Disable Access to public facilities	No. of building complying with MS 1184. 1183	+/-
Healthcare Expenditure	% of state health care expenditure to GDP	⊖
Traffic Safety	No. of casualties and fatalities from road accidents	⊖
Children at Risk	No. of reported child abuse cases	⊖
Social Ills Among Youth	Incidents of reported juvenile crimes	⊖
Domestic Violence	No. of domestic violence reported	⊖
Unplanned Pregnancies	No. of single unwed mothers in homes	⊖
Persons with HIV & AIDS	No. of new AIDS cases and HIV carries detected	⊖
Housing Affordability	No. of new AIDS cases and HIV carries detected	?
<b>INDICATORS ON ECONOMY ( Economic Productivity Roundtable )</b>		
Corporate Environmentalism	No. of companies certified MS ISO 14001	⊖
Staple Food Security	"Paddy production, average rice yield"	⊖
Economic Diversity	Employment concentration	+/-
Tourism Industry	Average hotel occupancy rate	+/-
Fisheries Yield	Total landing of marine fish	+/-
Informal Sector	No. of licensed itinerant hawkers issued and renewed by MPPP	?
<b>INDICATORS ON CULTURE ( Culture Vibrancy Roundtable )</b>		
Heritages Conservation	No of inventoried heritage buildings demolished	+/-
Public Library Usage	Rate of public library usage	+/-
Culture Infrastructure	No. of build venues for arts events	⊖
Signage Culture	% of street signs provided	⊖
<b>INDICATORS ON PARTICIPATION ( Popular Participation Roundtable )</b>		
Employment of Women	Ratio of women employed at various job level in the manufacturing sector	+/-
Environmental Awareness	No of environmental complaints to DOE	+/-
Public Participation in Town planning	% of population taking part in MPPP report of Survey	?
Voter Participation	No. of registered voters	?

## Appendix D

### **PENANG LAUNCHES INITIATIVE 21.21 - citizens to help shape future of Penang**

1. A creative opportunity for all Malaysian to participate in a popular exercise to shape the future of Penang was launched on 12 June 1999 by the Chief Minister of Penang Tan Sri Dr Koh Tsu Koon.
2. The initiative called 21 Projects for the 21st Century or Initiative 21.21 for short will involve citizens from all walks of life contributing ideas, big and small, that can improve their community, district or the state. Awards will be given for the best ideas.
3. The ideas will fall under five categories:
  - a. economic productivity
  - B. ecological sustainability
  - c. cultural vibrancy
  - D. social justice
  - E. popular participation

More background on these categories is obtainable in documents prepared as a result of the Sustainable Penang Initiative - the first of its kind in Asia. (see website below)
4. The ideas can be a project that can impact a local area, the state as a whole or even have global significance. The ideas will be judged on several criteria which will include creativity and innovation, practicality and effectiveness and benefit the state of Penang.
5. Schools, community organizations, government agencies, business enterprises and academia will be specially invited to take parts in the process. The media will also be invited to be partners in this creative venture.
6. The nominations will involved submitting a simple one page description of the idea which can be accompanied by a graphic presentation. A website is also proposed to enable electronic participation. As Penang is a leader in information technology. this mode is expected to be popular. Eventually all the ideas may be posted on the site as a testimony to the creativity of the people of Penang.
7. The project which will open nominations in the next few months will be managed by the Socio Economic and Environmental Research Institute (SERI), a new and independent think-tank in Penang. SERI has been charged with the responsibility of drawing up Penang's Strategic Plan for the next ten years and the ideas from this initiative will be actively taken into account. An exhibition of the best ideas is also planned.
8. This is the first time probably anywhere in the world that such creative and challenging exercise of popular participation in the planning of a state has been done. For Penang it is to demonstrate that it is not just enough to speak about People friendly government but we must also actively involve the people in shaping the future of Penang in the 21st century. There is a whole new generation of creative and energetic people whose energy and talent must be tapped.
9. The initiative will be headed by a team led by Dato' (Dr) Anwar Fazal, a director of SERI and a Senior Regional Advisor with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), and YB Dato' Dr Toh Kin Woon. State

Executive Councillor responsible for overseeing the development of the Strategic Plan for Penang.

10. Further confirmation about the initiative can be obtained from **Socio-Economic and Environmental Research Institute (SERI)**.  
**Email: [seripg@tm.net.my](mailto:seripg@tm.net.my) Website: <http://www.seri.com.my>**